

THE SCOTTISH
HISTORICAL REVIEW

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS LTD.

Parkside Works Edinburgh 9

36 Park Street London W1

117 Latrobe Street Melbourne C1

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS (AFRICA) (Pty) LTD

P.O. Box 9881 Johannesburg

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS (CANADA) LTD.

91-93 Wellington Street West Toronto 1

THOMAS NELSON AND SONS

18 East 41st Street New York 17, N.Y.

SOCIÉTÉ FRANÇAISE D'ÉDITIONS NELSON

97 rue Monge Paris 6

THE SCOTTISH HISTORICAL REVIEW

Volume Forty-second

EDINBURGH
THOMAS NELSON & SONS, LTD.

1962

THE
SCOTTISH
HISTORICAL
REVIEW

EDITED BY
JAMES H. BURNETT
AND
JAMES H. BURNETT

Contents

	PAGE
An Appreciation of Professor W. Croft Dickinson. By Gordon Donaldson, D.Litt. - - - - -	viii
<i>Articles:</i>	
Anglo-Scottish Relations from Constantine II to William. By Alan O. Anderson, LL.D. - - - - -	1
The Use of Libraries by the Working Class in Scotland in the Early Nineteenth Century. By Alastair R. Thompson -	21
A Sequel to Edward Bruce's Invasion of Ireland. By Ranald Nicholson - - - - -	30
The Conciliarist Tradition in Scotland. By J. H. Burns -	89
Agrarian Improvement and the Development of Enclosure in the South-west Highlands of Scotland. By R. A. Gailey	105
The Roman Legionary Fortress at Carpow, Perthshire. By Robin Birley - - - - -	126
Further Information on the Life and Likeness of George Buchanan. By J. K. Cameron - - - - -	135
The King's Mails, 1603-1625. By William Taylor - -	143
<i>Reviews:</i>	
William Croft Dickinson, <i>Scotland from the Earliest Times to 1603: A New History of Scotland</i> , Vol. I. Reviewed by John Imrie - - - - -	41
Stewart Cruden, <i>The Scottish Castle</i> . Reviewed by E. M. Jope	148
George S. Pryde, <i>Scotland from 1603 to the Present Day: A New History of Scotland</i> , Vol. II. Reviewed by Esmond Wright - - - - -	154
Nora K. Chadwick, <i>The Age of the Saints in the Early Celtic Church</i> . Reviewed by Aubrey Gwynn - - - - -	157
<i>Short Notices</i> - - - - -	46, 160

<i>List of Articles on Scottish History published during the year 1962</i>	167
----------------------------------------------------------------------------	-----

Notes and Comments:

'His Body Shall Be Brought to the Lists'. By W. Croft Dickinson - - - - -	84
Anglo-Scottish Militia Negotiations, March-April 1646. By Charles L. Hamilton - - - - -	86
Principal Accessions to the Register House, 1962. By Sir James Fergusson, Bart., LL.D. - - - - -	176

<i>List of Abbreviated Titles of the Printed Sources of Scottish History to 1560 - - - - -</i>	<i>Supplement</i>
------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------

Contributors to this Volume

Alan O. Anderson
Prof. T. S. Ashton
Edith C. Batho
Robin Birley
J. H. Burns
Prof. John Butt
J. K. Cameron
Prof. W. Croft Dickinson
Prof. Gordon Donaldson
A. I. Dunlop
Sir James Fergusson
Ian Finlay
R. A. Gailey
Malcolm Gray
Prof. Aubrey Gwynn
Charles L. Hamilton
Hamish Henderson
Prof. Edward Hughes
John Imrie
Prof. E. M. Jope
John Larner

Prof. J. D. Mackie
I. M. M. MacPhail
Prof. Angus Matheson
Rev. W. Matheson
Stuart Maxwell
Rev. Stewart Mechie
Athol Murray
Donald Nicholas
Ranald Nicholson
Patrick Nuttgens
J. H. Plumb
F. D. Price
Prof. George Shepperson
William Taylor
Alastair R. Thompson
D. E. R. Watt
C. V. Wedgwood
Rev. H. C. Whitley
William P. D. Wightman
Prof. Esmond Wright

An Appreciation
of
Professor W. Croft Dickinson
C.B.E. M.C. D.Lit. Hon.LL.D. (St Andrews)

William Croft Dickinson, who had edited this *Review* since 1947, died on 22 May 1963, at the age of sixty-six. A graduate of St Andrews, he was Librarian of the London School of Economics for ten years before his appointment to the Fraser Chair of Ancient (Scottish) History and Palaeography in the University of Edinburgh in 1944. St Andrews University conferred on him its honorary degree of LL.D. in 1952, and in the New Year Honours List this year he was made a Commander of the Order of the British Empire.

Professor Dickinson's own researches were concentrated on the institutions of medieval Scotland, but he was alive to the importance of every period and every topic in Scotland's past. It was as part of his determination to advance by every means the study of his subject that he resolved, soon after his appointment to the chair at Edinburgh, to revive the *Scottish Historical Review*, which had ceased publication in 1928. For the sixteen years during which the *Review* had his constant thought and care, he brought to his editorial labours an unremitting capacity for work, a meticulous attention to detail, methodical habits of business and a wide knowledge of publishing and book production. Under his editorship, the *Review* maintained standards which gave it a place in the highest rank of historical journals. His services to Scottish history were many, but none of them surpassed in importance his work on this *Review*.

GORDON DONALDSON

It is hoped to publish a fuller memoir of Professor Dickinson with a bibliography of his writings in a later number of the *Review*.

Index

	PAGE		PAGE
<i>Age of the Saints in the Early Celtic Church, The</i> , by Nora K. Chadwick, reviewed by Aubrey Gwynn	157	<i>Buik of the Kirk of the Canagait, The, 1564-1567</i> , ed. Alma B. Calderwood, reviewed by Stuart Maxwell	63
Agrarian Improvement and the Development of Enclosure in the South-west Highlands of Scotland, by R. A. Gailey	105	Burns, J. H., <i>The Conciliarist Tradition in Scotland</i>	89
<i>Agricultural Sir John: The Life of Sir John Sinclair of Ulbster</i> , by Rosalind Mitchison, reviewed by Malcolm Gray	78	Butt, John, review by (<i>The Wisdom of the Scots</i>)	161
Alman, Miriam, and Crick, B.R., eds., <i>Guide to Manuscripts Relating to America in Great Britain and Ireland</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson	65	Calderwood, Alma B., ed., <i>The Buik of the Kirk of the Canagait, 1564-1567</i> , reviewed by Stuart Maxwell	63
<i>America, A guide to Manuscripts relating to, in Great Britain and Ireland</i> , ed. by B. R. Crick and Miriam Alman, reviewed by G. Shepperson	65	Cameron, J. K., <i>Further Information on the Life and Likeness of George Buchanan</i>	135
Anderson, Alan O., <i>Anglo-Scottish Relations from Constantine II to William</i>	1	Campbell, R. H., <i>Carron Company</i> , reviewed by T. S. Ashton	46
<i>Anglo-Scottish Militia Negotiations March-April 1646</i> , note by Charles L. Hamilton	86	Carpow, Perthshire, <i>The Roman Legionary Fortress at</i> , by Robin Birley	126
<i>Anglo-Scottish Relations from Constantine II to William</i> , by Alan O. Anderson	1	<i>Carron Company</i> , by R. H. Campbell, reviewed by T. S. Ashton	46
Ashton, T. S., review by (<i>Carron Company</i>)	46	Chadwick, Nora K., <i>The Age of the Saints in the Early Celtic Church</i> , reviewed by Aubrey Gwynn	157
Balfour-Melville, E. W. M., [<i>Historical Association of Scotland</i>]: <i>Reminiscences of our First Fifty Years</i> , reviewed by J.D.M.	79	Clement, A. G., and Robertson, Robert H. S., <i>Scotland's Scientific Heritage</i> , reviewed by W. P. D. Wightman	56
Barclay, Robert S., ed., <i>The Court Book of Orkney and Shetland, 1612-1613</i> , reviewed by G. Donaldson	77	<i>Conciliarist Tradition in Scotland, The</i> , by J. H. Burns	89
Batho, Edith C., review by (<i>James Hogg: A Critical Study</i>)	83	<i>Court Book of Orkney and Shetland, The, 1612-1613</i> , ed. by Robert S. Barclay, reviewed by G. Donaldson	77
Bindoff, S. T., and others, eds., <i>Elizabethan Government and Society</i> , reviewed by F. D. Price	66	Cowan, Helen I., <i>British Emigration to British North America</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson	73
Birley, Robin, <i>The Roman Legionary Fortress at Carpow, Perthshire</i>	126	Crick, B. R., and Alman, Miriam, eds., <i>Guide to Manuscripts relating to America in Great Britain and Ireland</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson	65
Boyd, William, <i>Education in Ayrshire Through Seven Centuries</i> , reviewed by A. I. Dunlop	54	Cruden, Stewart, <i>The Scottish Castle</i> , reviewed by E. M. Jope	148
<i>British Emigration to British North America. The First Hundred Years</i> , by Helen I. Cowan, reviewed by G. Shepperson	73	Dickinson, W. Croft, note by ('His Body Shall Be Brought To The Lists'), 84; <i>Scotland from Earliest Times to 1603</i> , reviewed by J. Imrie, 41; An Appreciation of	viii
Buchanan, George, <i>Further Information on the Life and Likeness of</i> , by J. K. Cameron	135	Donaldson, Gordon, An Appreciation of Professor W. Croft Dickinson, viii; review by (<i>The Court Book of Orkney and Shetland</i>)	77
		Dunlop, A. I., review by (<i>Education in Ayrshire</i>)	54

	PAGE		PAGE
<i>Education in Ayrshire Through Seven Centuries</i> , by William Boyd, reviewed by A. I. Dunlop - -	54	Haldane, A. R. B., <i>New Ways through the Glens</i> , reviewed by Sir James Fergusson - -	52
Edward Bruce's Invasion of Ireland, A Sequel to, by Ranald Nicholson	30	Hamilton, Charles L., note by (Anglo-Scottish Militia Negotiations, March-April, 1646) -	86
<i>Elizabethan Government and Society: Essays presented to Sir John Neale</i> , ed. by S. T. Bindoff and others, reviewed by F. D. Price	66	<i>Handbook of British Chronology</i> , 2nd edn., ed. by Sir F. M. Powicke and E. B. Fryde, reviewed by R. Nicholson - - - -	80
Enclosure, Agrarian Improvement and the Development of, in the South-West Highlands of Scotland, by R. A. Gailey - - -	105	Henderson, Hamish, review by (<i>The Silver Bough</i>) - - - -	70
<i>Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticanæ</i> , Vol. IX, ed. J. A. Lamb, reviewed by S. M. Fergusson, Sir James, reviews by (<i>New Ways Through the Glens</i>) 52; (<i>Stage-Coach to John O'Groats</i>) 64; note by (Principal Accessions to the Register House, 1962) - - - -	60	Hexter, J. H., <i>Reappraisals in History</i> , reviewed by C. V. Wedgwood - - - -	51
Foskett, R., <i>Some Scottish Links with the American Episcopal Church, 1685-1785</i> , reviewed by G.S. - - - -	176	<i>Highland Scots of North Carolina, The, 1732-1776</i> , by D. Meyer, reviewed by G. Shepperson -	75
<i>Fifteenth Century, The</i> , by E. F. Jacob, reviewed by D. E. R. Watt - - - -	77	'His Body Shall Be Brought To The Lists', note by W. Croft Dickinson - - - -	84
Finlay, Ian, review by (<i>St. Ninian's Isle Treasure</i>) - - - -	61	[<i>Historical Association of Scotland, The</i>]: <i>Reminiscences of our First Fifty Years</i> , by E. W. M. Balfour-Melville, reviewed by J.D.M. -	79
Fryde, E. B., and Powicke, Sir F. M., eds., <i>Handbook of British Chronology</i> , 2nd edn., reviewed by R. Nicholson - - - -	68	<i>Historical Manuscripts Commission: The Polwarth Manuscripts</i> , Vol. V., ed. by H. Paton, reviewed by Edward Hughes - - - -	58
Further Information on the Life and Likeness of George Buchanan, by J. K. Cameron - - - -	90	Hughes, Edward, review by (<i>Historical Manuscripts Commission: The Polwarth Manuscripts</i> , Vol. V) -	58
	135	Imrie, John, review by (<i>Scotland from the Earliest Times to 1609</i>) -	41
		Ireland, A Sequel to Edward Bruce's Invasion of, by Ranald Nicholson	30
		Jacob, E. F., <i>The Fifteenth Century</i> , reviewed by D. E. R. Watt -	61
		James Hogg: <i>A Critical Study</i> , by L. Simpson, reviewed by Edith C. Batho - - - -	83
	105	J.D.M., see Mackie, J. D. - - -	
	64	Joze, E. M., review by (<i>The Scottish Castle</i>) - - - -	148
	59	King's Mails, 1603-1625, <i>The</i> , by William Taylor - - - -	143
	73	<i>Könige von England und das Reich 1272-1377, Die</i> , by Fritz Trautz, reviewed by John Larnier - -	74
	78	Laffin, John, <i>Scotland The Brave: The Story of the Scottish Soldier</i> , reviewed by J. D. Mackie - -	165
	65	Lamb, J. A., ed., <i>Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticanæ</i> , Vol. IX, reviewed by S.M. - - - -	60
	157	Larnier, John, review by (<i>Die Könige von England und Das Reich</i>) - - - -	74
		Libraries, The Use of, by the Work-	
Gailey, R. A., Agrarian Improvement and the Development of Enclosure in the South-west Highlands of Scotland - -			
Gardiner, Leslie, <i>Stage-Coach to John O'Groats</i> , reviewed by Sir James Fergusson - - -			
Gibson, A. J. H., <i>Stipend in the Church of Scotland</i> , reviewed by H. C. Whitley - - -			
Gipson, L. H., <i>The Triumphant Empire</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - -			
Gray, Malcolm, review by (<i>Agricultural Sir John</i>) - - -			
G.S., see Shepperson, George			
<i>Guide to the Manuscripts Relating to America in Great Britain and Ireland</i> , ed. by B. R. Crick and Miriam Alman, reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - -			
Gwynn, Aubrey, review by (<i>The Age of the Saints</i>) - - -			

Index

179

	PAGE		PAGE
ing Class in Scotland in the Early Nineteenth Century, by Alastair R. Thompson - - - -	21	A. R. B. Haldane, reviewed by Sir James Fergusson - - -	52
Lindsay, Ian G., <i>The Scottish Parish Kirk</i> , reviewed by Patrick Nuttgens - - - - -	69	Nicholas, Donald, reviews by (<i>Memoirs of James II</i>) 76; (<i>Roehenstart, a Late Stuart Pretender</i>) - - - - -	82
List of Abbreviated Titles of the Printed Sources of Scottish History to 1560 - - - - -	Supplement	Nicholson, Ranald, review by (<i>Handbook of British Chronology</i> , 2nd edn.), 80; A Sequel to Edward Bruce's Invasion of Ireland - - - - -	30
List of Articles on Scottish History Published during the Year 1962 - - - - -	167	Northcott, Cecil, <i>Robert Moffat. Pioneer in Africa</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - - -	57
<i>Livingstone's Missionary Correspondence, 1841-1856</i> , ed. by I. Schapera, reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - - -	57	Nuttgens, Patrick, review by (<i>The Scottish Parish Kirk</i>) - - - -	69
Mackie, J. D., reviews by (<i>[Historical Association of Scotland]: Reminiscences of our First Fifty Years</i>) 79; (<i>Scotland the Brave</i>) - - - - -	165	O'Dell, Andrew C., <i>St. Ninian's Isle Treasure</i> , reviewed by Ian Finlay - - - - -	68
Mackie, R. L., <i>A Short History of Scotland</i> , revised by G. Donaldson, reviewed by I. M. M. MacPhail - - - - -	160	Paton, Henry, ed., <i>Historical Manuscripts Commission: The Polwarth Manuscripts</i> , Vol. V., reviewed by Edward Hughes - - - - -	58
McLaren, Moray, <i>The Wisdom of the Scots: A Choice and a Comment</i> , reviewed by John Butt - - - -	161	Plumb, J. H., review by (<i>The Whig Supremacy, 1714-1760</i>) - - - -	160
McNeill, F. Marian, <i>The Silver Bough</i> , Vol. III. <i>Hallowe'en to Yule</i> , reviewed by Hamish Henderson - - - - -	70	<i>Polwarth Manuscripts</i> , Vol. V., <i>Historical Manuscripts Commission</i> , ed. by Henry Paton, reviewed by Edward Hughes - - - - -	58
MacPhail, I. M. M., review by (<i>A Short History of Scotland</i>) - - -	160	Powicke, Sir F. M., and Fryde, E. B., eds., <i>Handbook of British Chronology</i> , 2nd edn., reviewed by R. Nicholson - - - - -	80
Matheson, Angus, review by (<i>Monro's Western Isles of Scotland</i>) - - - - -	48	Price, F. D., review by (<i>Elizabethan Government and Society</i>) - - -	66
Matheson, W., review by (<i>The Scottish People</i>) - - - - -	72	Principal Accessions to the Register House, 1962, note by Sir James Fergusson - - - - -	176
Maxwell, Stuart, review by (<i>The Buik of the Kirk of the Canagait</i>) - - - - -	63	Pryde, George S., <i>Scotland from 1603 to the Present Day</i> , reviewed by Esmond Wright - - - -	154
Mechie, Stewart, review by (<i>Fasti Ecclesiae Scoticanæ</i> , Vol. IX) - -	60	<i>Reappraisals in History</i> , by J. H. Hexter, reviewed by C. V. Wedgwood - - - - -	51
<i>Memoirs of James II, The</i> , ed. by A. Lytton Sells, reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - - - -	76	Reid, W. Stanford, <i>Skipper from Leith: The History of Robert Barton of Over Barnton</i> , reviewed by Athol Murray - - - - -	163
Meyer, Duane, <i>The Highland Scots of North Carolina, 1732-1776</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - -	75	<i>Reminiscences of our First Fifty Years: [Historical Association of Scotland]</i> , by E. W. M. Balfour-Melville, reviewed by J.D.M. - -	79
Mitchison, Rosalind, <i>Agricultural Sir John: The Life of Sir John Sinclair of Ulbster</i> , reviewed by Malcolm Gray - - - - -	78	Rennie, James-Alan, <i>The Scottish People. Their Clans, Families and Origins</i> , reviewed by W.M. - -	72
<i>Monro's Western Isles of Scotland and Genealogies of the Clans, 1649</i> , ed. by R. W. Munro, reviewed by Angus Matheson - - - - -	48	<i>Robert Moffat. Pioneer in Africa</i> , by Cecil Northcott, reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - - -	57
Munro, R. W., ed., <i>Monro's Western Isles of Scotland and Genealogies of the Clans, 1649</i> , reviewed by Angus Matheson - - - - -	48	Robertson, Robert H. S., and Clement, A. G., <i>Scotland's Scientific Heritage</i> , reviewed by W. P. D. Wightman - - - - -	56
Murray, Athol, review by (<i>Skipper from Leith</i>) - - - - -	163		
<i>New Ways Through the Glens</i> , by			

<i>Roehenstart, a Late Stuart Pretender</i> , by George Sherburn, reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - - -	PAGE	82	<i>Skipper from Leith: The History of Robert Barton of Over Barnton</i> , by W. Stanford Reid, reviewed by Athol Murray - - - -	PAGE	163
Roman Legionary Fortress at Carpow, Perthshire, The, by Robin Birley - - - - -	126		<i>Some Scottish Links with the American Episcopal Church 1685-1785</i> , by R. Foskett, reviewed by G. S. S.M., see Mechie, Stewart	77	
Schapera, I., ed., <i>Livingstone's Missionary Correspondence, 1841-1856</i> , reviewed by G. Shepperson	57		<i>Stage-Coach to John O'Groats</i> , by Leslie Gardiner, reviewed by Sir James Fergusson - - - -	64	
<i>Scotland from Earliest Times to 1603: A New History of Scotland</i> , Vol. I, by W. Croft Dickinson, reviewed by John Imrie - -	41		<i>Stipend in the Church of Scotland</i> , by A. J. H. Gibson, reviewed by H. C. Whitley - - - - -	59	
<i>Scotland from 1603 to the Present Day: A New History of Scotland</i> , Vol. II, by George S. Pryde, reviewed by Esmond Wright -	154		<i>St. Ninian's Isle Treasure</i> , by Andrew C. O'Dell, reviewed by Ian Finlay	68	
<i>Scotland The Brave: The Story of the Scottish Soldier</i> , by John Laffin, reviewed by J. D. Mackie - -	165		Taylor, William, <i>The King's Mails, 1603-1625</i> - - - -	143	
<i>Scotland's Scientific Heritage</i> , by A. G. Clements and Robert H. S. Robertson, reviewed by William P. D. Wightman - - - -	56		Thompson, Alastair R., <i>The Use of Libraries by the Working Class in Scotland in the Early Nineteenth Century</i> - - - -	21	
<i>Scottish Castle, The</i> , by Stewart Cruden, reviewed by E. M. Jope	148		Trautz, Fritz, <i>Die Könige von England und das Reich 1272-1377</i> , reviewed by John Lerner - -	74	
<i>Scottish Parish Kirk, The</i> , by Ian G. Lindsay, reviewed by Patrick Nuttgens - - - - -	69		<i>Triumphant Empire, The: Thunder Clouds Gather in the West, 1763-66</i> , by L. H. Gipson, reviewed by G. Shepperson - - - -	73	
<i>Scottish People, The: Their Clans, Families and Origins</i> , by James Alan Rennie, reviewed by W.M. Sells, A. Lytton, ed., <i>The Memoirs of James II</i> , reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - - - -	72		Use of Libraries by the Working Class in Scotland in the Early Nineteenth Century, The, by Alastair R. Thompson - - -	21	
Sequel to Edward Bruce's Invasion of Ireland, by Randal Nicholson Shepperson, George, reviews by (<i>Livingstone's Missionary Correspondence</i>) 57; (<i>Robert Moffat. Pioneer in Africa</i>) 57; (<i>Manuscripts relating to America in Great Britain</i>) 65; (<i>British Emigration to British North America</i>) 73; (<i>The Triumphant Empire</i>) 73; (<i>The Highland Scots of North Carolina</i>) 75; (<i>Some Scottish Links with the American Episcopal Church</i>) - - - - -	76	30	Watt, D. E. R., review by (<i>The Fifteenth Century</i>) - - - -	61	
Sherburn, George, <i>Roehenstart, a Late Stuart Pretender</i> , reviewed by Donald Nicholas - - -			Wedgwood, C. V., review by (<i>Reappraisals in History</i>) - - -	51	
<i>Short History of Scotland</i> , by R. L. Mackie, revised by G. Donaldson, reviewed by I. M. M. MacPhail			<i>Whig Supremacy, The, 1714-60</i> , by Basil Williams, revised by C. H. Stuart, reviewed by J. H. Plumb	162	
<i>Silver Bough, The</i> , Vol. III. <i>Hallowe'en to Yule</i> , by F. Marian McNeill, reviewed by Hamish Henderson - - - - -			Whitley, H. C., review by (<i>Stipend in the Church of Scotland</i>) - -	59	
Simpson, Louis, <i>James Hogg: A Critical Study</i> , reviewed by Edith C. Batho - - - - -			Wightman, William P. D., review by (<i>Scotland's Scientific Heritage</i>)	56	
			Williams, Basil, <i>The Whig Supremacy 1714-60</i> , revised by C. H. Stuart, reviewed by J. H. Plumb	162	
			<i>Wisdom of the Scots, The: A Choice and a Comment</i> , by Moray McLaren, reviewed by John Butt -	161	
			W.M., see Matheson, W.		
			Working Class in Scotland in the Early Nineteenth Century, The Use of Libraries by, by Alastair R. Thompson - - - - -	21	
			Wright, Esmond, review by (<i>Scotland from 1603 to the Present Day</i>)	154	

